IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA NORTHERN DIVISION

MELVIN LOWE,

Plaintiff,

VS. CASE NO. 2:05-CV-0495

MONTGOMERY COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION, et al.,

Defendants.

The deposition of MELVIN ALONZA LOWE,

III, was taken before Cornelia J. Baker,

Certified Court Reporter and Certified

Shorthand Reporter, as Commissioner, on

Tuesday, January 3, 2006, commencing at

approximately 9:41 a.m., in the law

offices of Beers, Anderson, Jackson,

250 Commerce Street, Montgomery, Alabama,

pursuant to the stipulations set forth

herein.

22

23

Α.

Ed.D.

- Q. Okay. Hold on. Let me ask you this:
 Are there any other degrees that you
 received at Alabama State University --
- A A. No.
- 5 Q. -- that you haven't already told me about?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. All right. And then you went to Nova?
- 9 A. Nova Southeastern University.
- 10 Q. Is that a university that you did on line or through the mail?
- 12 A. No. I attended campus in Atlanta,

 13 Georgia, and I even had to attend campus

 14 in Ft. Lauderdale, Florida.
- 15 Q. Where is their main campus?
- 16 A. They have two campuses, Ft. Lauderdale,
 17 Florida, and South Miami Beach.
- 18 Q. Okay. Did you do some of the courses through correspondence?
- 20 A. All of the courses were site courses,
 21 except for maybe the few that had to be
 22 taken on line. All courses were site
 23 courses in Atlanta, Georgia.

- 1 Q. Back before they were bought by -- it's
 2 escaping me -- Baptist Health?
 - A. Well, I worked at the location downtown, so it's now closed.
 - Q. Yeah. What years did you work for Troy Massey? You said four years?
 - 7 A. Towards the end of completing my
 8 undergraduate degree. I would have to
 9 look back.
- 10 Q. So did you work for him part-time while you were going to college?
- 12 A. Yes, I did.

4

5

6

- 13 Q. And what type of job responsibilities did you have for Mr. Massey?
- 15 A. Anything from possibly running errands,

 16 to sitting in on depositions for opening

 17 and closing cases, preparing documents

 18 for court, litigated issues and

 19 concerns.
- 20 Q. Okay. And what about Dr. Franklin -21 excuse me -- yeah, Dr. Franklin?
- 22 A. I worked as a student office assistant.
- 23 Q. And what about Columbia Regional

Q. What do you mean by that?

1

8

9

10

11

1.2

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

- 2 A. I had students -- I had IEPs for

 students who were ED, which at one time

 was EC, emotionally conflicted; now ED,

 emotional disorder. Hearing impaired,

 LD, and MR. And if I recall, I think I

 had one student who was autistic.
 - Q. When you say -- I know a little bit about self-contained classrooms, but one thing I do know is that different people mean different things when they say self-contained. When you say self-contained, tell us what you mean.
 - A. Self-contained is when you are teaching all subjects. You're not departmentalized. You're teaching all subjects.
 - Q. Well, did the group of students that you'd teach stay with you all day?
 - A. They remained with me all day.
 - Q. So you got them in the morning and you taught the various subjects throughout the day, and they left you in the

- you make to obtain another job there?
- 2 A. If I stand corrected, I followed the

 normal procedures that I had been given

 through Human Resources to reapply to be
 reassigned for the following year.
- 6 Q. And were you reassigned?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And where did you go?
- 9 A. Fitzpatrick Elementary.
- 10 Q. And what was your teaching assignment?
- 11 A. Fourth grade basic social, which was a departmentalized setting.
- 13 Q. What does that mean?
- 14 A. That means I taught the basic social subjects, math, science, social studies, and P.E. for fourth grade students.
- 17 Q. Okay. So you had the same group of students all year --
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. -- you had a fourth grade classroom? 21 Okay. Strike that.
- 22 A. The department -- I'm sorry.
- 23 Q. So you had certain subjects for the

- In your unit. I gotcha. 20 Q.
- And this was a regular education unit. 21 Α.
- And did you have any other teaching 22 Q. assignments or responsibilities 23

- And did you request that transfer? 1
- I was presented a job offer, and I Α. 2 accepted. 3
- Did you ever at any time ask to be 4 Ο. transferred from Fitzpatrick? 5
- During the course of that year, I 6 Α. initiated an interest in a transfer. 7

9

- When you say you "initiated an interest Q: in a transfer," what do you mean?
- Can you be real clear with me and ask me 10 Α. what do I mean? I initiated an interest 11 towards a transfer. 12
- I mean, did you ask to be transferred? 13 Q. Did you talk to Jimmy Barker or talk to 14 anybody? 15
- I talked -- I communicated with 16 Α. Mr. Barker. 17
- And you wanted to be transferred? 18 Q.
- I initiated an interest. 19 Α.
- Okay. Why did you initiate an interest 20 Q. in being transferred? 21
- There was, what I thought, some 22 Α. disharmony in the setting at 23

BAKER & BAKER REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC. Certified Court Reporters and Certified Legal Video Specialists 334.262.3332 - 1.888.253.DEPS (3377)

www.baker-baker.com

- Fitzpatrick, and at that time I felt that a transfer might be the solution.
 - Q. Tell me what you mean by disharmony there. What was going on?

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- A. There was, I think, a misunderstanding between myself and the administrator.
- Q. And what was that misunderstanding?
- A. I might have or she might have overexerted certain authorities that I felt uncomfortable with.
- 11 Q. Okay. And tell us what you mean by

 that. I mean, what happened? What

 happened to your relationship or what

 happened that there was a

 misunderstanding between you?
 - A. I just felt that she, Ms. Thompson, was over exerting her authorities.
 - Q. What did she do that made you believe that or made you feel that way?
 - A. There were a number of things, just too many to call off the top of my head.

 But there were just a number of things that I felt uncomfortable with during

that year.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

- Okay. Do you mean things that she would Ο. ask you to do or times that she would reprimand you? I mean, I'm just trying to get an idea of what it was she was doing that made you uncomfortable.
- Her disposition. I was uncomfortable Α. with her disposition.
- Like in the manner that she dealt with you, her mannerisms, her tone?
- Yes. We can say that, that I was Α. uncomfortable with her tone and her overall demeanor towards me.
 - Would she ever correct you or talk to you about the way you were teaching, and you would become unhappy with that?
- She never gave me any directives as far 17 Α. as my teaching. 18
- Did she ever ask -- did she ever correct 19 Q. you in regards to your teaching? 20
- She never supervised my teaching, 21 Α. therefore, she never was able to provide 22 me any directives towards my teaching. 23

BAKER & BAKER REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC. . Certified Court Reporters and Certified Legal Video Specialists 334.262.3332 - 1.888.253.DEPS (3377)

www.baker-baker.com

2.0

- Q. Okay. Whether or not you think she was capable or should have been able to, was there ever occasions where she attempted, at least, to talk to you about your teaching style or what you were teaching?
- A. Well, I'm not -- I'm not saying that she was incapable. I'm just saying she never.
- Q. Okay. So you never had any conferences with her about your job performance at the school?
- A. We talked just as, I guess, she did with other teachers. I need your lesson plans at this particular time. I might change this particular student out of your room, or do you have everything you need? As far as any directives, I would like to see you teach this way; I do not see this; there were never any communications of that sort.
- Q. Okay. What did she do that you felt like was exerting too much authority

over you?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1.0

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

A. The uncomfortableness of her exertions.

Some verbal communications that I didn't feel were in my best interest or as far as an academia concern. I didn't feel they had anything to do with my academic -- academia performances. That made me feel uncomfortable.

- Q. So she would say and do things around you that didn't have anything to do with your job performance, and you thought that was inappropriate?
- A. I'm not going to say they didn't have anything to do with my job performances.

 They did not have anything to do with my job presence or my performance in the capacity of a teacher.
 - Q. Okay. Tell us what it was that she would say and do that made you have this uncomfortableness.
- 21 A. To be very specific, there was an

 22 incident when she asked me to conference

 23 with her in her office, and she accused

- me of keeping a disturbance among the faculty.
 - Q. Okay.

- A. I was totally clueless of what she was talking about. And I felt that she was using her authority as my administrator in having communicated to me, You're nontenured and you've had some problems in the past, and I did you a favor when I hired you. I was uncomfortable with that statement.
- 12 Q. Okay. And why were you uncomfortable with that?
 - A. I don't find that a normal statement that you would say to an individual, You had problems in your past teaching assignment. Because I knew of none. I didn't know of any problems. To reiterate that I was nontenured, I was currently aware that I was nontenured. And to suggest that you did me a favor, I was totally uncomfortable with that.
 - Q. Okay. Do you know whether she went out

- on a limb or did you some favor to get you the job at Fitzpatrick? Do you have any awareness about how that came about --
- I don't see where she --Α.

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

20

21

- Make sure you let me finish my question. 6 Q.
 - Yes, yes. I'm sorry. Α.
 - Do you have any awareness about Okay. how that came about, about how you got assigned to her school?
- Ms. Vera Thompson called me at my 11 mother's home one evening after 11:00. 12 And she just asked me, Do you want to 1.3 teach at Fitzpatrick? Having known of 14 her, I accepted. Going out on a limb? 15 I was fully educated and certified with 16 the correct credentials to teach, so I 17 don't know what type of limb she could 18 have gone out on. 19
 - Did you know Ms. Thompson before you Q. worked for her?
 - Vaguely. 22 Α.
 - You knew of her, but 23 Q.

BAKER & BAKER REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC. Certified Court Reporters and Certified Legal Video Specialists 334.262.3332 - 1.888.253.DEPS (3377)

www.baker-baker.com

I knew of her. Α.

7

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

- Didn't have any kind of family 2 Q. relationship with her? 3
 - Not at all. Α.
 - Socialize with her or anything like Ο. that?
- Not at all. 7 Α.
 - You've described one conversation that Q., you felt was inappropriate or made you feel uncomfortable. Tell us any other conversations that occurred that were like that.
 - That was the only conversation that I Α. was totally uncomfortable with. other discussions that we had after that had to deal with a student or a conference or a field trip or something of that nature. There was never anything else. That was -- that was somewhat of a beginning and an end.
 - Okay. So when you talk about not being Q. comfortable with the authority that she's exerted over you because of the

BAKER & BAKER REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC. Certified Court Reporters and Certified Legal Video Specialists 334.262.3332 - 1.888.253.DEPS (3377)

www.baker-baker.com

1.7

- uncomfortableness you had, you're really talking about that conversation?
 - A. And prior to the demise of that behavior, there were some instances where I was uncomfortable when she stepped -- when she entered my classroom. I'm not accustomed to someone entering my classroom and not speaking, especially after I've spoken to you. I'm uncomfortable when my students speak to you and you don't speak back, and they are then looking at me wondering what is going on. And the students can sense that there is some hostility here.

I don't appreciate, and I feel uncomfortable when other teachers are asked to supervise me and to report to the administrator what I'm doing. And I guess out of fear of our friendship, those teachers admitted to me this is what I've been asked to do; I just want to stay out of it. Those were the

1.4

things that made me uncomfortable. And I was uncomfortable the entire year, although there were no more direct conferences that would make me -- I would be able to put my finger on it. But those were the scenarios that I was uncomfortable with the entire year.

- Q. Okay. Fair enough. Well, who were some of the teachers that told you that they were asked to supervise you?
- A. Mr. Terry Myrick (phonetic). He's no longer in Montgomery County. He's now teaching in Georgia. He taught next door to me, who communicated that Ms. Thompson asked him on several occasions to let her know what was going on in my room.
- 18 Q. Do you know why she did that?
- 19 A. Well, I don't think it's best practice.
 20 I don't know why she would have done
 21 that, but he verbalized to me that she
 22 did it.
 - Q. Yeah. And I'm not questioning that. I

And what did they tell you exactly?

not sure.

22

2.3

Q.

- What had she asked them to do according to them?
 - A. To -- Mr. Myrick's room was right next to my room.
- 5 Q. Yes, sir.

4

She asked him to let her know what was 6 going on in my classroom. 7 Stevenson's room was at the other end of 8 the building. And she just told me, I 9 think it was around Christmas, that you 1.0 are my friend, and I don't want you to 1.1 be upset with me, but you do know 12 Ms. Thompson asked me to let her know 13 what you were doing in your room, which 14 I don't understand, because your room 15 was at the other end of the building. I 16 mean, it was just too -- I mean, you 17 taught second grade. I taught fourth 18 grade. Mr. Myrick taught fifth grade. 19 There was no reason we would even have 20 to collaborate unless we were possibly 21 dealing with some special needs issues 22 or some curriculum issues, which we 23

didn't do any of that type of planning 1 that year. 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

- Did you ever ask Ms. Thompson about this Q. or confront her? Confronting might be a bad word. Did you ask her, Why do you have these folks supervising me? What's the problem?
- No, I didn't. I was not in a position Α. to accost her.
- Anything else from that year that you Q. 10 can tell us about why you had initiated 11 interest in transferring out of there? 12
- Just the uncomfortableness with her 13 Α. her demeanor. 14
- And you, in fact, were transferred that 1.5 Q. I guess you completed that summer. 16 school year? 17
- Yes. And I did not receive a 18 Α. nonrenewal. 19
- Right. And then you were transferred 20 Q. from there to Southlawn? 21
- Middle. Southlawn Middle School. 2.2 Α.
- I quess -- is Southlawn Middle School. 23 Q.

- No, I don't. 1 Α.
- What about with Ms. Tucker? 2 Q.
- Oh, no -- no problem at all. 3 Α.
- Okay. And let me go back quickly and 4 Q. ask you about Donnie Terry, who was the 5 administrative assistant at Fitzpatrick. 6
- No problems. 7 Α.
- No problems with him? 8 Q.
- No problems. 9 Α.
- Did you ever communicate with him about 10 Q. your problems with Ms. Thompson, or did 11 you just choose not to do that? 12
- It wasn't in the best interest to do 13 Α. that, and I did not. 14
- Okay. So as far as having any 15 Q. complaints or anything of that nature, 16 you would not have had any against 17 Ms. Minott or Ms. Tucker?
- No. 19 Α.

- Okay. Now, at the end of that year, 20 0. were you nonrenewed? 21
- At the end of that year, I was Α. 22 nonrenewed. 23

- Q. Okay. And that summer, did you apply for other jobs with the Montgomery County School System?
- 4 A. Yes, I did.
- 5 Q. Okay. Do you know what jobs you applied for?
- 7 A. I would have to look, be provided
 8 documents of what I initially applied
 9 for. The first thing I did reapply for
 10 was to be reassigned.
- 11 Q. You wanted to go back there?
- 12 A. Back there or anywhere in the system.
- 13 Q. Oh, I see what you're saying. Okay.
- And if I understand correctly, that did not happen at that time?
- 16 A. It did not happen.
- 17 Q. Okay. And I take it that you applied with other school systems?
- 19 A. I did.
- 20 Q. Okay. And where did you get a job?
- 21 A. Bullock County.
- 22 Q. So that was for the -- keeping up with this, the '02-'03 school year, you were

- 20 So you taught reading all day, and the sixth graders came to you in shifts?
- 21 A. And I taught all of the sixth graders in the school.
- 23 Q. Okay.

- 1 A. I was the only sixth grade reading teacher.
- Q. And these were -- you've already said this, but just for clarification -- these were all the sixth graders; it wasn't a special category or anything like that?
- 8 A. These were all the sixth graders.
- 9 Q. You were the reading teacher for the sixth grade?
- 11 A. Regular education and Special Education.
- 12 Q. Okay. Who was your principal?
- 13 A. Mr. Julius Thomas.
- 14 Q. And who was the vice president?
- 15 A. Mr. Anderson Graves.
- 16 Q. Did you have any problems with Mr. Thomas or Mr. Graves?
- 18 A. No, no problems at all.
- 19 Q. No complaints or problems with them?
- 20 A. None.
- 21 Q. Were you nonrenewed at the end of that year?
- 23 A. At the end of that year, yes, all

- nontenured teachers in the entire 7 district were nonrenewed. 2
 - Did you attempt to get another job with Q. them, with the Bullock County School System after you were nonrenewed?
- In fact, the superintendent I did. 6 promised, You will be back. 7
 - And why did you not go back? Q.
- I did go back. 9 Α.
- To Bullock County? Q. 10
- Yes. Α. 11

4

5

8

21

- Okay. Oh, yeah, I'm sorry. 12 Q.
- So you were nonrenewed. 13
- Everyone across the district was, and 14 then you got reassigned or placed back 15
- into the system? 16
- Same school. 17 Α.
- Same school, same job? 1.8 Q..
- Same school. They just -- instead of 19 Α.
- teaching reading all day, we then went 20 to -- what did we go to? I think we
- went to a self-contained setting, and I 22
- had the same students all day. 23

- $1 \mid Q$. For what grade?
- A. And I taught all subjects. Sixth grade.
- Q. So you just had a regular sixth-grade class?
- 5 A. Yes.

9

1.0

11

1.5

- 6 Q. Okay. And so did you have the same principal and vice principal?
 - A. The same principal. The second year

 Ms. Harriet (phonetic) -- I can't think

 of her last name, but we had a female

 assistant principal.
- 12 Q. Same question: Did you have any
 13 problems with the principal or vice
 14 principal in the '03-'04 school year?
 - A. No, I did not.
- I would -- I didn't finish

 answering the first question. You asked

 did I apply to anywhere else after the

 initial -- the first nonrenewal program

 from Bullock County.
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. I did. I reapplied to Montgomery County 23 for several positions.

- 1 o. so in the summer of '03?
- 2 A. The summer of '03, the ending of my

 first full year in Bullock County. To

 reanswer your first question, I did

 apply for teaching jobs, and I applied

 back to Montgomery County.
 - Q. And do you have any specific memory of any particular job, or were you just applying with Montgomery County for any teaching position you were certified?
 - A. I would have to look back at my initial letters of concern or intent. To the best recollection, any job with my certification that would allow me employment, I was seeking those jobs.
 - Q. And that was in the Summer of '03. So you did not get hired by Montgomery public schools that summer?
- 19 A. Unfortunately not.
- 20 Q. Okay. So you went back to Bullock
 21 County for the '03-'04 school year?
- 22 A. Yes, I did.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

23 Q. Okay. Did you get hired during the

- meet with either of us together. He would meet with us separately.
- Okay. I went through -- I'm not going 3 0. to promise that I read every word of 4 every sheet of paper, but I tried to go 5 through the documents that your lawyer 6 gave to me to help today go smoother and 7 so that I would know what you had. 8 I didn't see any kind of notes or 9 anything about conferencing with 10 Dr. Carter. Is that something that you 11 have that you have not provided your 12 lawyer as of yet? 13
 - A. No. Because I never conferenced with Dr. Carter.

15

16

17

1.8

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Oh, I thought you said you would have to refer to notes regarding when --
- A. A date. I was going to refer to the notes for a particular date when we initiated a conference. But I never conferenced with Mr. Carter.
 - Q. What would you look at to tell you what date you attempted to talk to him?

- I would maybe have to go back and look 1 at some documentation that I might have 2 provided EEOC to see if a date was in 3 there, when an initial conference 4 when we tried to made an initial 5 conference. But I'm also sure that his 6 secretary would be able to go through 7 notes to see when the conference was 8 confirmed, when the call was placed for 9 an initial conference, and when the 1.0 conference was confirmed, and who it was 11 But I never met with Mr. Carter. 12 He would not meet with me. 13
 - Why were you attempting to conference Q. with Dr. Carter?

15

16

17

1.8

19

20

21

22

23

After numerous conversations with Α. Mr. Barker and Ms. Lois Johnson, it was suggested that, Melvin, you might want to apologize to Mr. Carter and see if he will let -- and allow you to be rehired in Montgomery County. Ms. Lois Johnson communicated that to both my mother and myself, as well as Mr. Barker.

> BAKER & BAKER REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC. Certified Court Reporters and Certified Legal Video Specialists 334.262.3332 - 1.888.253.DEPS (3377)

www.baker-baker.com

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1.2

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

- Mr. Barker reaffirmed that if Dr. Carter says I can hire you, I can have you in a job within an hour or a couple of hours as soon as he says it's okay. It's not me, it's him.
- Why did you need to apologize to him? Q. What would you be apologizing for?
- I would -- I still don't know. I still Α. don't know.
- Did it have anything to do with the Q. incident where you were placed on administrative leave due to the interaction with a child while you were at Southlawn Middle School?
 - Well, I don't see why I would have to apologize for something I didn't do and I was not found guilty of doing. I don't know if that was what was intended for me to apologize for. That was never communicated to me by Mr. Barker, that this is an event that you need to apologize for. The only thing that he said, Mr. Barker felt you

BAKER & BAKER REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC. Certified Court Reporters and Certified Legal Video Specialists 334.262.3332 - 1.888.253.DEPS (3377)

www.baker-baker.com

1.8

- misunderstandings or hard feelings or embarrassments that I may or may not have caused the school district. That's provided I would have had an opportunity to talk with him.
- Q. And I understand you didn't talk to him.

 I'm just confused about what you were

 going to apologize for if you say,

 sitting here today, you don't know what

 you were supposed to have apologized

 for?
- A. I'm also confused. I don't know what I did or didn't do that I needed to apologize for.
- 15 Q. When did you have these conversations with Jimmy Barker?
 - A. Again, I would have to look back at my notes. But it was during the summer before returning to Bullock County.
 - Q. It was in the Summer of '03. So you get nonrenewed after Southlawn. You apply and get a job in Bullock County. And then after that summer, the Summer of

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

1.2

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

Α.

103 -- or was it the summer right after you got nonrenewed from Southlawn?

- The summer after I was nonrenewed from Southlawn, it was almost I was going in circles. I would go out on interviews. Nothing would materialize from that. Or in one particular instance, I was interviewed, and I heard the principal in a conversation with Ms. Carolyn Hicks. And it was stated, Well, I've made my decision, but I'll just interview this person, but I've already made my decision. And that principal even told me, I'm not going to hire you, because you're too educated. I think your concentrations need to be toward administration, and I just can't have you on my faculty. And that was Mr. Michael Linhart (phonetic), who is now assistant superintendent of curriculum instruction, K through six.
- Where was he a principal? Q.
- He was principal at E.D. Nixon 2.3 Α.

and none of them wanted Melvin.

Ms. Hicks checked with seven principals

22

23

1.5

- Q. Okay. I'm looking at something that you gave to EEOC that said that Mr. Barker informed you that Ms. Hicks said that in the Summer of '03, which would have been after you worked in Bullock County a year. So let's look at the Summer of '02. Can you think of anything else from that -- or do you think --
 - A. The Summer of '02, I could not get an interview. That was after Southlawn, if I stand corrected with these years. I could not get an interview for anything.
 - Q. And what is your testimony today as to why you could not get an interview?
 - A. Well, you have a series of events that cause you to put certain events into a proper perspective. After Southlawn, when I received the nonrenewal, it was a total surprise, because my relationship with Ms. Minott allowed me to know who was receiving nonrenewals. And I was not one of her select persons to receive a nonrenewal. I was, in fact, in her